

## I. INTRODUCTION & SUMMARY

Delegates to the seventh annual conference on Education, Values and Citizenship were welcomed on behalf of the conference steering group and supporting organisations<sup>1</sup> by Sheila Bloom, Chief Executive, of the Institute for Global Ethics UK Trust.

The event was augmented by a series of position papers from each of the five countries which are now available on the website [www.ltscotland.org.uk/fivenations](http://www.ltscotland.org.uk/fivenations)

The intention of this report is to capture the key points, conclusions and recommendations that emerged from the conference.

In summary, the conference delegates – representing teachers, administrators, government and non-government organisations – concluded that Values and Citizenship Education are:

- (1) **Urgent and necessary**, and should be developed as a conscious and considered response to the social, cultural and political challenges facing us in the world beyond the classroom. In this context the challenge to education goes beyond simple measures of academic attainment, and must address the values, capacities and dispositions demanded by our times.
- (2) **A priority for the whole school** and its *community partners*. As such values and citizenship education should be a leading concern for heads, senior managers and community partners as well as subject specialists and practitioners.
- (3) **In need of continuing support**, shared good practice and – particularly important – the development of robust self- and peer-group evaluation. In this context the ‘Five Nations’ conference and networks can, and should, play a continuing and formative role.

## II. KEYNOTE ADDRESSES

*The keynote addresses set the scene for sharing practice, reflection and proposals for future work.*

**Pamela Munn** pursued some of the implications of this challenge through exploring the disjunctions between policy and practice.

**Keir Bloomer** painted a vivid backdrop to our consultations by depicting the cultural and social changes that prompt the need for radical educational reforms.

**Christine Carlin** offered Scotland’s education goals and *Curriculum for Excellence* as a case study for those concerned with national policy and practice.

**Mary McLaughlin** narrowed the focus to concentrate on policy and practice in Notre Dame High School in Glasgow.

---

<sup>1</sup> The event was organised by the Institute for Global Ethics UK Trust in association with Learning and Teaching Scotland, and supported by the Gordon Cook Foundation, the Scottish Executive, the Department for Education and Skills (England), the Department of Education (Northern Ireland), the Welsh Assembly Government and the Curriculum Development Unit (Ireland).

## 2.1 Values Education

*Pamela Munn OBE, Dean and Head of Moray House School of Education, University of Edinburgh.*

### Global Context

Across the world there is a growing interdependence between peoples, cultures and economies. Universal solutions are, increasingly, offered for public sector reform. Current nostrums include (i) belief in the efficacy of *competition and choice* among providers in public services; (ii) *accountability linked to performance and choice* (e.g. League Tables), and (iii) the rhetoric of *evidenced-based policy*. Decision-making is devolved to those most immediately affected by the decisions; but these decisions concern *how services are delivered*, rather than strategic choices about *what services should be provided*.

### Embedded Practice

Cultural policies and practices - of which citizenship education is a typical example - travel around the world. On the surface they often appear remarkably similar. For example the policy objective of education for citizenship is to foster democratic participation as the pathway to civic engagement, civil behaviour and social cohesion.

### *Underlying v. Espoused Values*

The local implementation of this objective, however, lays bare the underlying values of those responsible for implementing them. These underlying values may be in conflict with officially espoused values of citizenship education. For example, the espoused value of youth participation is to empower young people to have an effective voice in the decisions that affect their lives. In practice, however, such participation may be seen as a subtle form of social control designed to constrain the wayward behaviour of a youth culture that is perceived as out of control.

### *Diversity and Identity*

Similar tensions can arise over diversity and identity. Attempts to instil social cohesion around a narrow definition of Britishness may similarly be experienced by some as an attempt to substitute uniformity for diversity. A more useful strategy might be to develop positive attitudes towards multiple identities. Attempts to tackle racism by imposing narrowly prescriptive responses to unacceptable behaviour can likewise create more problems than it solves. (Examples of precisely this practice were given by participants.)

### Intended and unintended messages

It is relatively easy to agree on a set of values at the macro-level. But the practical realities of implementing these values in the personal, institutional and national contexts require that we pay attention to the intended and unintended messages given off by our words and actions. For example, we need critically to scrutinise: -

- ❑ **Curriculum materials** tackling poverty, ethnic minorities, women and people with disabilities.
- ❑ **Policy papers** supporting young people’s decision making.

- ❑ **Materials** giving teachers accounts of young people's participation.  
Are the espoused values in these approaches congruent with the actual values that motivate those seeking to apply them? Are these messages consistent with the values being promoted in related contexts throughout the school?  
For example:
- ❑ **School meals:** What messages are being sent out by the way school meals are provided in relation to, say, fair trade, waste and healthy eating?
- ❑ **Organisation of the curriculum:** Which values are given priority through assessment and high stakes testing?
- ❑ **Rituals:** What do assemblies, star pupils, displays etc tell us about the values of the school and the classroom?

## 2.2 Values - Action and Reflection

Keir Bloomer, Chief Executive, Clackmannanshire Council

### Education is a Moral Undertaking

*'The education of a child is first and foremost a moral undertaking.'* Michael Fullan

The concern to include values education within the curriculum has been an explicit commitment in Scottish education in recent generations. The Advisory Council, set up by the Secretary of State in World War II, stated that schools are in the business of transmitting values. Education in this context is for the 'betterment of society'. A report on affective development likewise made direct reference to value. These values included 'individual moral values,' 'intellectual values', and values involving commitment to action.

Values education is neither new, nor confined to Scottish education. Across the world interest in values education is growing. The Norwegians, for example, pay attention to the impact of education on people's attitudes and dispositions. In Tasmania educators aim to nurture 'ethical human beings.'

### The Four Capacities

UNESCO, under the chairmanship of Jacques Delors, defined education as fostering a person's capacity to learn, to be, to live with others and to do.

#### Facing the Six Challenges

These capacities are fundamental to our coping effectively with the six key challenges that face us in the 21<sup>st</sup> century:

1. Mass destruction
2. A sustainable environment
3. Population growth
4. The North / South divide
5. Education reform
6. The breakdown in public and private morality

© Institute for Global Ethics 2000

This coincides with Scotland's emphasis on the four capacities that stem from effective education. Every child should become (i) a successful learner; (ii) a confident individual; (iii) an effective contributor; and (iv) a responsible citizen.

### Five Minds for the Future

The skills, insights and understanding needed to tackle these challenges are *not* the same as those that our inherited education systems have been designed to foster. We need to make an intellectual adjustment away from a 19<sup>th</sup> century view of knowledge – with its separate, unrelated subjects – towards a more systemic understanding of learning and capacity. We need to develop Prof Howard Gardner's five 'minds for the future.' These minds are:

- ❑ Disciplined
- ❑ Synthesising
- ❑ Creating
- ❑ Respectful
- ❑ Ethical

This new approach needs to take account of the salient changes that have been taking place in our culture.

- (i) In the 20<sup>th</sup> century our collective purpose was seen in terms of prosperity. The simple connection was made between wealth and happiness. The richer we are, the happier we become. But research now suggests that this is true only up to a point. There has now come a stage where more money fails to bring greater well-being.
- (ii) In our democracy there is evidence of declining participation, trust and relevance. The young citizens who are currently going through our education system are in future likely to be faced with a very different framework of governance from the system of representative democracy with which we are familiar, but which is clearly in a state of crisis.
- (iii) Public and civic institutions are *strongest* at the level where people are *least interested*. For example, people tend to be interested in *very local* issues, such as youth disorder or dog-fouling. They are also interested in the huge global issues such as climate change. Our most developed institutions, however, work across the intervening areas of European, UK and country-level legislation. We need to build effective government at local and international levels. Our confidence in previous certainties has been shaken.
  - ❑ We no longer take for granted that innovation means progress.
  - ❑ We are uncertain about our concept of the young human being. Childhood is the creation of the Enlightenment, and teenager a product of modernism.
  - ❑ We are ambivalent about the extent to which we value what we do in education. School buildings too often appear utilitarian and cheap compared, for example, with hotels and

shopping centres. Education has recently been described in the Wall Street Journal as ‘a cottage industry, marked by low investment, primitive technology and ineffective management. As such it is ripe for take-over.’

- ❑ There is now an unresolved debate about the tension between religious and secular values.

Against this background we are compelled to work out afresh the directions that we must take in recreating an education system for our time. Values and citizenship (or learning to live with others as UNESCO puts it) are central parts of the role of any 21st century education system that is genuinely seeking to equip young people for contemporary life.

## 2.3 Values in Scottish Education Policy

*Christine Carlin, Head of Qualifications, Assessment and Curriculum Division of the Scottish Executive*

In 1998 the Scottish Parliament assumed responsibility for education in Scotland and is charged with scrutinising the Executive, which is responsible for implementing policy around the national priorities set out in the Standards in Scotland’s Schools Act (2000). Detailed decisions on management and delivery are delegated to Local Authorities and schools.

Key challenges include the need to tackle: -

- ❑ Demographic and social issues
- ❑ Those disengaging from learning
- ❑ The lowest performing individuals
- ❑ Living our lives as responsible citizens and effective contributors
- ❑ Listening and learning from others

In a digital society learning is becoming increasingly important at the local, national and global levels and the education system must equip young people to meet its challenges. (See above, page 1 *Facing the Six Challenges*).

### **A Curriculum for Excellence**

A comprehensive review of the curriculum is now underway. Under the banner, *A Curriculum for Excellence*, the aim is to create for children and young people a coherent learning journey from 3 – 18. It is designed to enable each student to develop the capacity to be a:-

- ❑ Successful learner
- ❑ Confident individual
- ❑ Effective contributor, and
- ❑ Responsible citizen

The curriculum builds on a set of values, purposes and principles and lays down what children should learn and what choices they should have at each stage. In addition to ensuring that every child can read, write and count, they must have opportunities to develop skills and abilities

such as enterprise, creativity, and a healthy approach to life.

Schools will be expected to tailor this curriculum to meet the specific needs of individual pupils. Furthermore, schools will be helped to give recognition for wider achievement in ways that are comparable to the recognition currently given to success in examinations. In this context values education and education for citizenship will be central to the *Curriculum for Excellence*.

### **Specific Scottish Values**

The values underpinning Scottish Education are those upon which Scottish Society is based. They are summed up in the words inscribed on the Scottish Mace: - Wisdom, Justice, Compassion and Integrity. These values underpin the rights and responsibilities of individuals and nations, and provide the basis for tolerant, caring, compassion and respectful communities.

In this context education for values and citizenship is the responsibility of everyone in the school community, it is not the exclusive concern of a stand-alone subject.

## III SHARING PRACTICE

### 3.1 Values across the School

*A plenary presentation by Mary McLaughlin, Headteacher, and Celia Rooney, Head Girl and Nimrah Ahmed Deputy Head Girl of Notre Dame High School, Glasgow.*

#### **A Headteacher’s View**

The context:

The National Priorities for Education show a deep commitment to the belief that education is about transforming lives and improving communities:

- ❑ Achievement/attainment
- ❑ The Framework for Learning
- ❑ Inclusion and equality
- ❑ Values and citizenship
- ❑ Learning for life.

The National Debate on Education revealed widespread satisfaction with comprehensive education but concerns about the extent to which schools were preparing young people for life and work in the 21<sup>st</sup> century. The publication of “A Curriculum for Excellence” set out clearly the values, purposes and principles for Scottish Education and the Programme Board is leading the process of implementation of this ambitious agenda.

As a local authority school we must also contribute to key Glasgow City Council objectives including promoting social inclusion, health and wellbeing and improving educational attainment. The success of Glasgow’s development as a socially inclusive community committed to the promotion of equality and human rights and responsibilities depends to a large extent on the ability of our schools to be proactive in these areas.

Targets for learning are important, but they do not contradict an emphasis on values. An emphasis on values and citizenship can provide a framework for bringing many initiatives and priorities together in a coherent and meaningful way. Young people can learn to be successful, confident learners through educational experiences which engage them in open ended problem solving, which provide them with skills, attitudes and understanding of how they can contribute to the economic, cultural and civic wellbeing of our communities. They learn to become active and engaged citizens of the school and wider community. In doing this we are (in Neil Postman's words) 'creating a public' rather than merely serving it. This view of education for citizenship highlights a way of thinking about how learners learn and how communities develop through thoughtful and responsible participation for their present wellbeing and future development. It is a strategic and overarching set of ideas which has the potential to bring cohesion and direction to a range of educational aspirations and initiatives.

### Pupil Contribution

Celia and Nimra described the many ways in which they and their fellow pupils engage with and promote the values that underpin the life of their school. These values are explicit and include: (i) **Love** – compassion, care, friendship; (ii) **Respect** of self and others; (iii) **Equality** rooted in justice and fairness; (iv) **Trust** incorporating honesty and integrity.

In the Upper School there is a strong emphasis on leadership, which embraces (i) inclusion, (ii) empowerment and (iii) respect.

Pupils are encouraged to put their views forward – consider, comment, suggest – and there are opportunities to do this through the Pupil Council, House Meetings and the Reps on the School Board. Notre Dame pupils also play a part on the Glasgow City Council Student Council.

Across the school a range of activities and interest groups foster a culture where school values are explicit, understood and acted on. These include: -

- Lunch Clubs
- Eco School activities
- Health Promotion, including healthy eating and the Heart Stop programme with the British Heart Foundation. Blood donation.
- Global Issues: Amnesty / Justice and Peace; Partnership with a school in Maine, US, with whom they engage in joint performances by satellite link.
- Annual Talent Show

'The future is not what adults think; it is what children do,' says John Negroponte. Values and citizenship education can together create the push towards the 'tipping point' where we make the necessary changes in the ways we educate our children and young people.

## 3.2 The Good Practice Showcase

Effective practice was shared through a showcase carousel and small group 90-minute workshops. The carousel proved particularly welcome. It comprised representatives from 10 different projects from across the UK. Each project had just 10 minutes to share the why, how and who of their projects. Some projects were presented by students with support from their teachers.

The audience was divided into two sets of 5 small groups, each of which was conducted around the building to enjoy a seamless sequence of 5 presentations.

The following topics were presented: -

### Groups 1-5

1. TAN Dance – Sarah Bower and Gavin Ross on behalf of Pat Pecci, Project Manager: *Coping with transition from primary to secondary through dance.*
2. St Philomena's Primary School - Clare Harvey, Headteacher and pupils: *Values and Citizenship in Action - preparation for transition.*
3. Stonelaw High School - Isobel Gilchrist, RME department, Stewart Aitken S3 and Lynda Whiteford S6: *Promoting Citizenship through Fairtrade.*
4. East Renfrewshire Council - Stuart Allison, QIO and Mearns Castle High School - Yvonne Donald, SG pupil: *Influencing policy at a practical level with respect to recycling, healthy eating and the curriculum through consultation.*
5. Young Scot - Louise Macdonald, Deputy CEO: *The Role of Youth Information in Supporting Active Citizenship.*

### Groups 6-10

6. Children's Parliament - Cathy McCulloch, Director: *Children's Parliament - a national programme of active citizenship.*
7. Woodlands Primary School - Gillian Purves, Headteacher and Cathy McLeod, teacher, and two pupils *MSPs in Schools, Public Petition Project.*
8. Lenzie Academy - Alison Elliot, Principal Teacher of Modern Studies and pupils: *The Lenzie Lobby - making a world of difference.*
9. Jordanhill School - Derek Brown, Deputy Headteacher and Stuart Heron, Principal Teacher Learning and Teaching and Pupils: *Inspiring Enquiring Minds: Citizenship as Learning.*
10. CCEA - John McCusker, Principal Officer - Learning for Life and Work and Karen McCann, ACETS, Sector Lead: *Coping with Citizenship.*

## 3.3 Workshops

### 1. Changing the Culture:

*Inspiring Inquiring Minds: Citizenship as Learning* – Derek Brown & Stuart Heron and students, Jordanhill School, Scotland

*Welsh Baccalaureate Qualification*: Brian Lightman, Headteacher, St Cyprus School, Penarth.

### 2. Developing a Culture of Values

*Ethical Fitness® Framework*: Sheila Bloom, Institute for Global Ethics UK Trust with Gillian Pryce, James Hamilton Academy, Kilmarnock, Scotland.

### 3. Early Years & Transition

*Developing a Global Approach*: Elaine Watts, Falkirk Council

### 4. Impetus – Shared Values in Action

Julie Dawid (Scotland), Gerry Diver (N.Ireland) and Cheryl Tucker (Wales)

### 5. Global Citizenship

*Global Citizenship Project*: Molly McGavigan WoSDEC, Scotland

*Facing History and Ourselves: Us and Them*: Catherine Thompson and Sheelagh Dean, Belfast and Southern Education Library Boards, Northern Ireland

### 6. Philosophy for Children

*How to develop Values and Citizenship through Philosophical Dialogue*: Dr Catherine McCall, Scotland, and Paul Cleghorn, SAPERE

### 7. Rights Respecting Schools

*UNICEF's Rights Respecting School Award*: Bruce Wilkinson (UNICEF) and Wilma MacDonald, Headteacher, Dowanhill Primary School, Scotland.

*Rights, Respect and Responsibility: A New Framework for teaching and Learning*: Ian Massey, Hampshire Children Service, England

## IV. Reflection and Review

Chris Waller, Professional Officer, ACT, invited Henry Maitles and Hamish Ross to review the conference and reflect on the challenges that now face us.

### 4.1 Repositioning Humanity in School System

*Reading, writing, arithmetic are important only if they serve to make our children more humane.*  
Holocaust Survivor

Attainment, assessment and results need to be repositioned in relation to a fresh emphasis on humanity in the school system. This requires us to take *democracy* and *human rights* seriously:

□ Education is intrinsically bound up with *democracy* as, for example, the political protest of students in Tiananmen Square continues to remind us.

□ Children are already our fellow citizens, not citizens in waiting. *Article 12* of the *UN Convention on the Rights of the Child* states that children have the right to participate in decision making processes that may be relevant in their lives and to influence decisions taken in their regard—within the family, the school or the community.

## 4.2 Reflections on the Conference

### Some Challenges

'The conference has engaged us with real people and real concerns.' The energy, commitment and enthusiasm of contributors may obscure the fact that, taken overall, good practice is neither universal nor comprehensive.

For example: -

- **School Councils:** The evidence is mixed, but predominantly weak<sup>2</sup>
- **Contested Issues:** discussing controversial social/political/moral issues causes problems for many teachers<sup>3</sup>
- **Learning and Teaching:** Too few students have a say in what is taught and how they want to learn<sup>4</sup>.

### Are we being reflective enough?

Adding wings to caterpillars does not create butterflies - it creates awkward and dysfunctional caterpillars.  
Butterflies are created through transformation'

Stephanie Pace Marshall (1996)

We need to reflect more critically on our achievements in citizenship and values education. This includes paying greater attention to:

- **Boundaries:** Where do the *intended* and *unintended consequences* of our initiatives begin and end?
- **Congruence:** Is our *behaviour* congruent with what we are *saying*?
- **Permeating:** How far do the underlying values and principles of our project permeate the life of the school?
- **Research:** Are we systematically collecting evidence to test and report on the impact and implications of our projects?

<sup>2</sup> Hannam, 1998; Dobie, 1998; Rowe, 2000; Kerr et al, 2001; Lister, 2001; Mills, 2002; Taylor and Johnson, 2002; Chamberlin, 2003; Orlenius, 2003; London Secondary School Councils Action Research Project, 2006

<sup>3</sup> Maitles and Deuchar, 2004

<sup>4</sup> Dewey, 1915; Ritchie, 1999; Save the Children, 2000 and 2001; Burke and Grosvenor, 2003; Maitles, 2005; Maitles and Gilchrist, 2003, 2005 and 2006; Rudduck and Flutter, 2004; MacBeath and Moos, 2004; MacIntyre and Pedder (2005)

## Transformation

The task of citizenship and values education is to transform the culture of schools and communities, not to add further burdens to an overloaded curriculum.

## V. Responses from Delegates

*Conference participants followed this review through (i) a panel-led discussion and (ii) country-group discussions plus a final plenary.*

### 5.1 Panel Discussion

*Each country was represented by a 'critical friend' to respond to, provoke and challenge the conference.*

#### **John Sam Jones, Schools Adviser for PSE, Wales:**

(i) We have witnessed a major shift away from the earlier emphasis on English language and culture towards an emphasis on Welsh language and culture. This suggests the need to achieve a balance. (ii) Teachers need help with controversial and contested issues, e.g. the requirement to deal sensitively with sexual orientation.

#### **Jane Buckley, Consultant/Lecturer, England:**

Citizenship is concerned with the *democratic deficit* and values are concerned with the *moral deficit*. These are distinct but related agendas. We need to rescue these issues from the 'liberal fog' by returning to the Human Rights agenda and the *UN Declaration of the Rights of the Child*.

**John McCusker, Principal Officer, CCEA, Northern Ireland:** We need to use human rights as a secular way of addressing moral and democratic deficits, particularly in tackling sectarianism and racism.

Critical concerns are to:

(i) Foster tolerance of difference; (ii) Trust (and support) teachers in tackling issues; (iii) build on the values of justice, wisdom, integrity and compassion.

#### **Aidan Clifford, Director, Curriculum Development Unit, Ireland:**

Social justice, equality, inclusion and democracy and addressing disadvantage are central concerns in Republic of Ireland. We need to keep under review what we are doing in both islands, including the development of: (i) Joint projects; (ii) Systematic networking; and (iii) Developing new areas. We should develop a more robust democratic dialogue

#### **Comments from the floor:** Delegates noted:-

- (i) **The practical value** of sharing brief case studies as a stimulus to good practice in the classroom.
- (ii) **The tension** between using values and citizenship education as an *instrument of social control* (through empowerment) rather than a route to *educational transformation* and real dialogue.
- (iii) **The tension** between the *attainment agenda* and the personal and community *development agenda*
- (iv) **Contributions from practitioners and young people** are important and, perhaps, necessary to 'prevent the whims of ministers' dominating the policy agenda.
- (v) The need to **vary the format** of these conferences.

## 5.2 Final Plenary

*Each Country Group commented on (i) what it had gained from the conference and (ii) what it planned to do next.*

### 1. Scotland

- (i) **Now:** We valued the quality of the discussion, and recognise the need to tackle the more challenging and contentious ideas and practices.
- (ii) **Next:** We plan to develop our work on citizenship and values through our newly established online community, GLOW.

### 2. Wales

- (i) **Now:** We valued the conference in the context of the Welsh review of the curriculum-consultation in January 2007, implementation in 2008. This includes the challenge to embed PSE/citizenship in all aspects of the Commission.
- (ii) **Next:** We need to broaden values and citizenship education beyond the boundaries of the school. We hope to build effective links with parents and with health, social services and the voluntary sector.

### 3. N. Ireland

- (i) **Now:** We particularly valued the networking, workshops and case studies
- (ii) **Next:** We would value more time on workshops and case studies, and greater pupil participation. In Northern Ireland we intend to meet before the 2007 conference and to ensure continuity between this conference and the next in relation to critical and challenging approaches to our work on values and citizenship education.

### 4. Ireland

- (i) **Now:** We valued networking, the opportunity for reflection and the chance to identify common areas of interest.
- (ii) **Next:** Develop East-West as well as North-South partnership across the two islands, reflecting the commitments in the Belfast/Good Friday Agreement.

### 5. England

- (i) **Now:** Valued networking, exchange of ideas and practice. We are aware of the need to deepen our approach to values, particularly in relation to inclusion and culture differences.
- (ii) **Next:** The Association for Citizenship Teaching in partnership with the Institute for Global Ethics UK Trust offers to put on next year's conference in England. We propose that: -
  - ❑ **The theme** is contested and controversial issues
  - ❑ **Participants** should include school leaders and informal educators in addition to teachers and people from educational organisations.
  - ❑ **Relevant groups** of practitioners should meet to develop the themes between now and the next conference.

### 6. The Gordon Cook Foundation

Dr Bill Gatherer concluded the conference on behalf of the Gordon Cook Foundation. He said, 'The Foundation is ready to support the next event in England, and welcomes the proposal that there should be meetings between conferences. We are not committed to any single ideology. Our simple aim is to help people to help young people and children to grow up.'

The conference ended with a final vote of thanks to the Trustees of the Gordon Cook Foundation for their ongoing support, and to Christine Twine and Cathy Begley and the host team from Learning and Teaching Scotland, and to the staff of the Institute for Global Ethics UK Trust, for organising the conference.

John Potter  
Education Consultant  
Institute for Global Ethics UK Trust  
December 2006

